



Advisory Committee

MEETING¹ MINUTES

December 8, 2017, 10:00 am – 12:30 pm

Elihu Harris State Building
1515 Clay Street, 2nd Floor, Room 9
Oakland, CA 94612

1. Call to Order

Luisa Valiela, Advisory Committee (AC) Chair, called the meeting to order.

AC Member Attendance: Brian Benn, Bruce Beyaert, Erika Castillo, Steve Chappell, Francesca Demgen, Roger Leventhal, Jessica Martini-Lamb, Shelly Masur, Anne Morkill, Erika Powell, Ameer Raval, Ana Maria Ruiz, Gary Stern, Laura Tam, Luisa Valiela (Chair), Sarah Young

Staff Attendance: Matt Gerhart, Jessica Davenport, Kelly Malinowski, Karen McDowell, Anna Schneider

2. Determination of Quorum

There was no quorum.

3. Public Comment

Maureen Gaffney, Bay Trail Planner for the Association of Bay Area Governments, announced and handed out new San Francisco Bay Area Water Trail maps. Mark Bierman, Program Manager for the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers' Continuing Authorities Program (CAP) Center, announced that he is interested in partnering on habitat restoration projects. Craig Weightman, Acting Regional Manager for the California Department of Fish Wildlife's Bay Delta Region, announced that former Bay Delta Regional Manager Scott Wilson is leaving the Advisory Committee because he has taken an assignment outside the Bay Area and CDFW will be nominating a replacement from their staff for the Governing Board's consideration.

4. Announcements

Chair Valiela announced that the Measure AA Grant Program received 22 applications totaling \$47 million. Chair Valiela also announced that the Silicon Valley Leadership Coalition and the State Coastal Conservancy are funding an interagency effort to develop a

¹ No decisions could be made at this meeting because of the lack of a quorum.

proposal for dedicated regulatory agency staff to work in a coordinated manner on permitting for Measure AA projects. The interagency group, led by the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers, will be developing a proposal for the Governing Board's consideration. Anne Morkill announced that the National Living Shorelines Tech Transfer Workshop will take place on February 21 and 22, 2018 in Oakland.

5. Approval of Meeting Minutes of October 13, 2017

Decision: There was no quorum present to approve the minutes.

6. Staff Report from November 3, 2017 Governing Board Meeting

Project Manager Jessica Davenport reported that the Board heard a presentation on the *Bayland Ecosystem Habitat Goals Update*, and addressed administrative measures, such as approving a revised joint powers agreement and setting up a bank account to receive parcel tax funds.

7. Bay Restoration 101: The Importance of Pilot Projects

Roger Leventhal, Senior Engineer with the Marin County Flood Control & Water Conservation District, gave a presentation on the importance of pilot projects for demonstrating the effectiveness and learning about using natural methods to stabilize shorelines and reduce flood risk, particularly in light of sea level rise. He emphasized the need to do many small projects at multiples sites to learn what work where, and the need to educate various audiences, including coastal engineers, construction contractors, and communities, about these methods and the tradeoffs involved in different approaches. The AC had a robust discussion about various issues, including the need to educate upstream communities who need to help pay for solutions, as well as downstream communities that are vulnerable to current and future flooding.

8. Appointing Ad Hoc Subcommittees

The AC decided to form two ad hoc subcommittees, one focusing on advising the Governing Board on measures of success for the Measure AA grant program and a second focusing on communications. It was decided that staff and AC members involved in reviewing proposals should report back to the AC on lessons learned.

- **Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Measures of Success:** Erika Powell (lead), Brian Benn, Erika Castillo, Francesca Demgen, Roger Leventhal, Amee Raval, Sarah Young
- **Ad Hoc Subcommittee on Communications:** Anne Morkill (lead), Erika Castillo, Amee Raval, Ana Maria Ruiz

9. AC Meeting Dates for 2018

AC members reviewed the proposed 2018 AC meeting dates. Staff will announce the following dates to the public.

- March 9, 2018
- May 4, 2018
- June 29, 2018
- October 5, 2018

10. Public Comment

There was no public comment.



Advisory Committee

SUMMARY OF BRAINSTORMING SESSION ON SETTING 2018 GOALS

(Revised based on input at December 8, 2017 Advisory Committee Meeting)

Preliminary Ideas to Develop into Recommendations to Board

1. Use specific metrics to measure success of Measure AA program (see below)
2. Develop a monitoring program:
 - Create a Restoration Authority monitoring program to ensure coordination of monitoring across projects funded by Measure AA. I.e., all projects should have a baseline and similar projects should use consistent monitoring protocols.
 - Define the role of Measure AA funding in supporting a long term Wetlands Regional Monitoring Program that would include assessing how wetland restoration is contributing to the overall health of the Bay.
3. Develop a communications strategy to inform local elected officials, legislators, communities, and tax payers about what's going on with implementation of Measure AA
 - Communicate about how the Restoration Authority is achieving effectiveness and efficiency
 - Should be accessible
 - Reach and involve tribal and disadvantaged communities
 - Weave ecological services information into the communications strategy
 - Communicate multiple benefits of restoration projects
 - Use before/after photos (Available in Project Tracker in EcoAtlas database)
 - Communicate with public and private partners
 - Explain the relationship between restoration benefits, flood management benefits, and the use of recycled water in restoration projects (we note that there will be increasing pressure to direct recycled water to non-habitat uses)
 - Hold a workshop as part of a communication strategy
 - Conduct ongoing outreach with simple messages that relate back to the Measure AA campaign
4. Involve disadvantaged communities
 - Conduct community outreach and engagement, including education about how projects are developed
 - Support development of proposals from disadvantaged communities and nongovernmental organizations
 - Help small nongovernmental organizations and community-based organizations build capacity to apply for grants, to overcome barriers

- Invite representatives of disadvantaged communities to speak to Board about their proposals (*Staff note: It would be more appropriate to invite speakers to discuss completed projects. Proposed projects should go through the RFP process.*)
5. Explore financing mechanisms beyond government leverage, including measures of efficiency.
 6. Support public access that goes beyond the Bay Trail and interpretive panels
 7. Prioritize helping existing marshes adapt to sea level rise
 8. Conduct research on demographics relative to gaps in environmental education opportunities and recreation areas.
 9. Track projects from acquisition to completion (*Note: This is done in Project Tracker in the EcoAtlas online database.*)
 - acreage
 - planning stage
 - timeline

Proposed Ways for AC Members to Support Restoration Authority

1. Helping with communications
2. Lending support to speed up restoration work, e.g., seeking more funding
3. Holding a workshop to explain how to develop a project labor agreement (San Francisco Bay Joint Venture will host)
4. Helping jurisdictions collaborate on adaptation to sea level rise combining Bay restoration and flood protection (San Francisco Estuary Institute and SPUR are working on a project to support this)
 - Identify natural breaks in the shoreline/ support urban planning within ecologically defined areas
 - Engage the public

Suggested Future Presentations to AC (Beyond Bay Restoration 101 Series)

1. Environmental justice opportunities and gaps: what are needs and vulnerabilities?
2. Demonstration of Project Tracker
 - See if additional fields are needed for Measure AA projects
3. Public access
 - What has been constructed so far
 - What we are hoping for with Measure AA funding
4. Continue *Bayland Goals Science Update* discussion
 - AC needs a better understanding beyond “Bay Restoration 101” classes in order to make recommendations to the Governing Board, i.e., how mosaic of projects work together to address overall restoration strategy

5. Hurdles to getting projects implemented (Note: Make sure AC is aware of Save The Bay work.¹)
6. How to get projects on the ground quickly
7. Cost of moving dredged sediment for reuse in wetland restoration projects and the potential use of Restoration Authority funds for cost sharing.
8. Project permitting 101.
9. Short presentation on Measure AA grant agreement and its terms (This will be presented to the Governing Board in February 2018, which AC member may attend.)
10. Napa River: 20 Years of Experience with Flood Protection

Initial Work on AC Action 1a: Possible Measures of Success for Measure AA Grant Program

1. Goal: accountability to the public
2. Metadata on proposals received
 - Number of submittals
 - Type of originating organization
 - Type of project by goal (e.g., habitat restoration, flood protection, public access, etc.)
 - Project size
 - Geographic location
3. Available metrics of effectiveness and efficiency, potentially including a financial metric
4. Acres restored (Need definition of “restored,” i.e., must marsh vegetation be present?)
5. Amount of other funds leveraged by Measure AA funds
6. Amount of dredged material used
7. Amount of trash removed
8. Number of activities focused on pollution prevention
9. Metrics related to protecting public health, e.g., number of wetland restoration projects designed to avoid increasing mosquito populations.
10. Metrics to be developed
11. Other metrics of effectiveness and efficiency?²
12. How do we measure success beyond effectiveness and efficiency?
13. How to measure impact? What’s working well to create larger positive impact and how to measure?
14. Need to determine how flood risk reduction and its economic, public health, and regional infrastructure benefits are quantified
 - Draw on Santa Clara Valley Water District experience with integrating habitat into flood control projects

¹ Save the Bay has developed a short list of projects from the SFBRA project list that have barriers to implementation and is currently reaching out to the project proponents to help them overcome those barriers. The contact is Beckie Zisser.

² Perhaps consider FieldDoc or similar calculator for grant application. (Chesapeake Bay Stewardship Fund uses this application for measuring success.)

- Assess economic impact on community that will benefit from flood protection (e.g., what is the protection provided to disadvantaged communities?)
15. How do we ensure that we prioritize funding for long-lasting projects?
 16. How do we measure success in going from science to action?
 17. How are data and science translating to action on the ground?
 18. How can monitoring facilitate action?

Proposed Changes in AC Process

1. Hold meetings at different locations
 - Attract other partners
 - Educate and motivate folks around the Bay, e.g., folks in the Midpeninsula Open Space District's area

Next Steps

1. Determine what actions are being undertaken by other groups, e.g., San Francisco Bay Joint Venture committees and others, and connect interested AC members to those groups.
2. Determine what tasks are more appropriate for staff and other organizations, rather than AC, to do.
3. For remaining items that are not being done by other groups or staff, set priorities for AC tasks.
4. Form AC Ad Hoc Subcommittees to take on specific tasks.